

Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

# Journal of Hazardous Materials





**Research** Paper

# Dissemination of sulfonamide resistance genes in digester microbiome during anaerobic digestion of food waste leachate

Shouvik Saha<sup>a,b</sup>, Jiu-Qiang Xiong<sup>c</sup>, Swapnil M. Patil<sup>b</sup>, Geon-Soo Ha<sup>b</sup>, Jeong-Kyu Hoh<sup>d</sup>, Hyun-Kyung Park<sup>e</sup>, Woojin Chung<sup>f</sup>, Soon Woong Chang<sup>f</sup>, Moonis Ali Khan<sup>g</sup>, Ho Bum Park<sup>h</sup>, Byong-Hun Jeon<sup>b,</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Natural Resources Research Institute, University of Minnesota Duluth, Duluth, MN 55812, USA

<sup>b</sup> Department of Earth Resources and Environmental Engineering, Hanyang University, Seoul 04763, the Republic of Korea

<sup>c</sup> College of Marine Life Sciences, Ocean University of China, Qingdao 266003, Shandong, China

<sup>d</sup> Department of Obstetrics and Gynecology, College of Medicine, Hanyang University, Seoul 04763, the Republic of Korea

e Department of Pediatrics, College of Medicine, Hanyang University, Seoul 04763, the Republic of Korea

<sup>f</sup> Department of Environmental Energy Engineering, Kyonggi University, Suwon 16227, the Republic of Korea

<sup>g</sup> Chemistry Department, College of Science, King Saud University, Riyadh 11451, Saudi Arabia

<sup>h</sup> Department of Energy Engineering, Hanyang University, Seoul 04763, the Republic of Korea

### HIGHLIGHTS

#### GRAPHICAL ABSTRACT

- Cumulative methane yields enhanced by 37 % under SAs loading compared to FWL alone.
- Methanosarcinales-led acetoclastic methanogenesis played a predominant role in methanation.
- Dissemination of sul1 depended on intl1based HGT.
- Transmission of sul2 was intl1independent.
- · Methanogenesis was uninterrupted by the influence of SAs or ARGs.

#### ARTICLE INFO

Editor: Jianhua Guo

Keywords: Microbiome Anaerobic digestion Food waste leachate Methane Antibiotic resistance genes



## ABSTRACT

The preeminence of sulfonamide drug resistance genes in food waste (FW) and the increased utilization of highstrength organic FW in anaerobic digestion (AD) to enhance methane production have raised severe public health concerns in wastewater treatment plants worldwide. In this regard, the dissemination patterns of different sulfonamide resistance genes (sul1 and sul2) and their impact on the digester core microbiota during AD of FW leachate (FWL) were evaluated. The presence of various sulfonamide antibiotics (SAs) in FWL digesters improved the final methane yield by 37 % during AD compared with FWL digesters without SAs. Microbial population shifts towards hydrolytic, acidogenic, and acetogenic bacteria in the phyla Actinobacteriota, Bacteroidota,

\* Corresponding author. E-mail address: bhjeon@hanyang.ac.kr (B.-H. Jeon).

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2023.131200

Received 28 October 2022; Received in revised form 4 March 2023; Accepted 10 March 2023 Available online 12 March 2023 0304-3894/© 2023 Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved.

Chloroflexi, Firmicutes, Proteobacteria, and Synergistota occurred due to SA induced substrate digestion and absorption through active transport; butanoate, propanoate, and pyruvate metabolism; glycolysis; gluconeogenesis; the citrate cycle; and pentose phosphate pathway. The initial dominance of *Methanosaeta* (89–96 %) declined to 47–53 % as AD progressed and shifted towards *Methanosarcina* (40 %) in digesters with the highest SA concentrations at the end of AD. Dissemination of *sul1* depended on class 1 integron gene (*int11*)-based horizontal gene transfer to pathogenic members of Chloroflexi, Firmicutes, and Patescibacteria, whereas *sul2* was transmitted to Synergistota independent of *int11*. Low susceptibility and ability to utilize SAs during methanogenesis shielded methanogenic archaea against selection pressure, thus preventing them from interacting with *sul* or *int11* genes, thereby minimizing the risk of antibiotic resistance development. The observed emergence of cationic antimicrobial peptide, vancomycin, and  $\beta$ -lactam resistance in the core microbiota during AD of FWL in the presence of SAs suggests that multidrug resistance caused by bacterial transformation could lead to an increase in the environmental resistome through wastewater sludge treatment.

## 1. Introduction

Dependence on synthetic and semi-synthetic antibiotics to treat infectious diseases in humans and animals has led to the widespread dispersal of undegraded or partially metabolized antibiotics into waste streams of municipal and industrial sewage systems. This makes wastewater treatment plants (WWTPs) worldwide multidrug reservoirs [40,54]. It has been reported that the Covid-19 pandemic might be encouraging the overuse of antibiotics due to misinformation about antibiotics' benefits in patients with Covid-19 infection and the estimated global antibiotics use in human and terrestrial and aquatic food-producing animal sectors could reach 236,757 tons annually by 2030 [16,52]. Approximately 30–90 % of administered antibiotics are excreted through feces or urine as a cocktail of parent compounds and their metabolites due to incomplete metabolism by humans or animals [30,56]. The concentrations of different antibiotics and their metabolites vary considerably in WWTP influents and effluents, depending on the source of influent wastewater and the environmental persistence of antibiotics [55]. The accumulation of antibiotics in WWTPs creates selection pressure towards vertical and horizontal gene transfer (VGT and HGT, respectively) among and across bacterial populations and intensifies the prevalence of antibiotic-resistant microorganisms (ARMs) in natural wastewater microbiota, resulting in serious public health risks [62,63]. Antibiotic resistance genes (ARGs), mobile genetic elements (MGEs), and ARMs were more abundant in WWTP effluents than influents in Germany and China owing to favorable selection conditions for HGT among bacteria, resulting in ARMs that were resistant even to chlorination and UV treatment [23]. Therefore, understanding the fate of antibiotics, ARGs, MGEs, and ARMs during wastewater treatment is essential considering the environmental consequences affecting downstream surface water, soil, and groundwater.

Sulfonamide antibiotics (SAs) are potent antibiotics used to treat a variety of bacterial and protozoan infections in humans, livestocks, and aquaculture species [21,59]. SAs are frequently detected in WWTP influents and effluents worldwide because of their low susceptibility to chemical and enzymatic hydrolysis, in contrast to other antibiotics such as  $\beta$ -lactams, tetracyclines, chloramphenicol, and vancomycin [55]. Concentrations of SAs in wastewater streams vary between a few ng L<sup>-1</sup> and a few tens of  $\mu g L^{-1}$ , leading to the enrichment of these antibiotics in wastewater sludge (0.04–665 µg kg<sup>-1</sup>) [40,57]. SAs are the most frequently detected antibiotics in wastewater containing animal manure from the swine industry, with a concentration range of 91–235 mg  $L^{-1}$ [19]. Concentrations of SAs in hospital and livestock wastewater range between 5029 and 142,900 ng L<sup>-1</sup>. Nevertheless, the processing of food waste leachate (FWL) at WWTPs before its application in anaerobic digestion (AD) caused the accumulation of sulfamethoxazole in processed FWL (8817 ng L<sup>-1</sup>) from its initial concentration of 0.34 ng L<sup>-1</sup> [15]. The short hydraulic retention time (HRT) of typical WWTPs limits the biodegradation of antibiotics, especially SAs, resulting in their accumulation in activated sludge [34,61]. The hydrophobicity of some antibiotic residues favors a higher affinity to solids during primary and secondary treatments, which in turn leads to accumulation in

organic-rich activated sludge [38]. The high generation rate in WWTPs favored by short HRT intensifies this accumulation of antibiotics in activated sludge [14]. In recent studies, the high concentrations of SAs (~2.45 mg•kg<sup>-1</sup>) found in soil adjacent to poultry farms where manure/sludge (0.14–18 mg kg<sup>-1</sup> SAs) was applied as organic fertilizer has raised serious environmental concerns for the dissemination of ARGs [40,43]. Furthermore, the persistence of certain SAs, such as sulfame-thizole and sulfadiazine, during anaerobic digestion of pig manure over a period of 40 days demonstrates their recalcitrant nature compared to other SAs and suggests possible enrichment of soil microbiota with ARMs after the application of digested sludge as fertilizer in agricultural fields [11].

Prolonged antibiotic exposure has induced the evolution and proliferation of over 1000 subtypes of ARGs and decreased sludge microbial community richness [6,60]. Notably, densely populated sludge microbiota provides optimal conditions for HGT among bacterial species, which could lead to an increase in ARM up to  $10^{6}$ - $10^{10}$  copies g<sup>-1</sup> of sludge [23,33]. Substantially higher concentrations of the tetracycline ARGs tet(O) and tet(W) and the sulfonamide drug resistance gene sul1 (3-fold) were observed in treated sludge compared to the effluent at a WWTP in Michigan, which were responsible for the proliferation of tetracycline and sulfamethoxazole resistant bacteria in sludge up to  $7.08\times10^6$  and  $3.09\times10^8$  CFU g  $^{\text{-1}},$  respectively [12]. Manure soil applications induced a microbial shift towards ARMs through the HGT of 260 unique ARGs and MGEs [13]. Land application of biosolids from WWTPs elevated the concentrations of various ARGs, including tet(O), tet(W), and sul1 [33]. The abundance of the sulfonamide drug resistance genes sul1 and sul2  $(10^6-10^8 \text{ copies g}^{-1})$  and MGE class 1 integron gene intl1 (10<sup>5</sup>-10<sup>7</sup> copies g<sup>-1</sup>) in the wetland sediments of Sub-Saharan Africa suggests HGT and ARM enrichment due to anthropogenic wastewater discharge [1]. In contrast, the enrichment of agricultural soil with 108 unique ARGs and MGEs after the application of sewage sludge and chicken manure as fertilizer increased soil bacterial diversity by > 10 % and the dissemination of ARGs in the soil induced population shifts to the phyla Bacteroidota, Chloroflexi, Firmicutes, Gemmatimonadetes, and Planctomycetes [9]. The presence of a large number of pathogenic genera (Arcobacter, Comamonas, Flavobacterium, and Rhodococcus) in the effluents of anaerobic membrane bioreactors indicates the occurrence of HGT during anaerobic treatment, resulting in the dissemination of sul1 and *intl1* [63]. Furthermore, a significant increase (10<sup>5</sup>-fold) in *sul1* and intl1 occurred in comparison to tetracycline ARGs after land application of chicken manure-based mineral fertilizer [29]. This apparent close association between sul1 and intl1 could contribute to the generation of an HGT-mediated resistome and induce environmental pathogenicity in bacteria.

Dissemination of ARGs through food waste (FW) during FW treatment at WWTPs poses a serious threat to public health as utilization of high-strength organic waste (*i.e.*, FW) for the improvement of biogas production has attracted considerable attention worldwide owing to its high organic content [32,41,7]. A high incidence (88–90 %) of MGEs and sulfonamide drug resistance genes, especially *sul1* and *sul2*, observed in 18 sulfonamide-resistant *E. coli* isolates from whiteleg shrimp and pork samples indicated a high probability of HGT with serious consequences to public health [21]. The dominance of *sul1* in various Korean organic solid wastes, such as FW-recycling wastewater, sewage sludge, and manure, and its correlation with *intl1* indicate a high potential for HGT [28]. A strong positive association between *intl1* and various ARGs in the effluents of full-scale FW digesters contributed to the induction of HGT [37]. In this regard, AD of FWL was conducted in the presence of SAs to evaluate the fate of antibiotics, ARGs, and MGEs; the diversity of ARMs in digesters; and the functional potential of the core microbiome. A correlation matrix was generated to determine the dissemination patterns of different ARGs and MGEs among the digester microbiota during AD to raise public awareness.

## 2. Materials and methods

### 2.1. Preparation of substrate, antibiotics, and inoculum

Food waste leachate was collected from the cafeteria of Hanyang University, Seoul, Republic of Korea and characterized following the methods described in our previous study [48]. Sulfamethoxazole and sulfamethazine ( $\geq$ 98.0 % purity, HPLC grade) were purchased from Sigma-Aldrich (St. Louis, MO, USA) and used as representative SAs. Anaerobic digester sludge (ADS) from Jungnang Sewage Treatment Center, Seoul, Republic of Korea was characterized as described above and used as inoculum for AD. Characteristics of FWL (Table 1) resembled the typical Korean FWL [27].

## 2.2. Anaerobic digestion

Anaerobic digestion of FWL in the presence of two different SAs (sulfamethoxazole and sulfamethazine) was performed in digesters with 550 mL capacity at mesophilic temperature (37 °C) and 150 rpm. The experiments were conducted in triplicate. Digester inoculation was performed under  $a > 99 \% N_2$  atmosphere in a Vinyl Anaerobic Chamber, Type B (Coy Laboratory Products, Inc., Grass Lake, MI, USA) using ADS and with 45 % headspace. The concentration of FWL (21 g total solid L<sup>-1</sup>) in the digesters was maintained at 49 % of the total volatile solids (VS) by adding the inoculum to the FWL at a ratio of 1:1 (VS basis). Sodium bicarbonate (5 g L<sup>-1</sup>), L-cysteine–HCl (0.5 g L<sup>-1</sup>), cobalt sulfate (2.6 mg L<sup>-1</sup>), and nickel chloride (2.2 mg L<sup>-1</sup>) were added to the digesters to promote anaerobic microbial growth [49,51]. The initial pH was adjusted to 7.10 using a 5 N HCl solution. SAs were added to

#### Table 1

Properties		Inoculum	FWL
Proximate	Total solid (wt%)	$\textbf{2.59} \pm \textbf{0.005}$	$\textbf{6.17} \pm \textbf{0.001}$
analysis	Volatile solid (dry wt%)	$67.21 \pm 0.09$	$82.12 \pm$
	Ash (wt%)	0.85 +	1.10 +
		0.0004	0.0001
	Fixed carbon (dry wt%)	31.94 $\pm$	16.78 $\pm$
		0.085	0.004
	Total carbohydrate (dry wt	$\textbf{34.14} \pm \textbf{5.48}$	$19.14\pm0.24$
	%)		
	Total lipid (dry wt%)	ND	$36.35~\pm$
			0.004
	Total protein (dry wt%)	$30.64 \pm 0.32$	$26.01\pm0.36$
Ultimate analysis	Total carbon (dry wt%)	$32.31\pm0.17$	$45.35\pm0.17$
	Total nitrogen (dry wt%)	$\textbf{4.90} \pm \textbf{0.06}$	$\textbf{4.16} \pm \textbf{0.06}$
	Total hydrogen (dry wt%)	$5.09 \pm 0.06$	$\textbf{6.76} \pm \textbf{0.06}$
	Total sulfur (dry wt%)	$0.79 \pm 0.12$	$\textbf{0.29} \pm \textbf{0.12}$
	Total oxygen (dry wt%)	$56.89 \pm 0.22$	$\textbf{43.44} \pm \textbf{0.22}$
	(by difference)		
	C/N ratio	6.59	10.89
Physical	pH	$\textbf{7.45} \pm \textbf{0.01}$	$\textbf{4.65} \pm \textbf{0.01}$
properties	Calorific value (kJ g <sup>-1</sup> )	$\textbf{20.38} \pm \textbf{0.02}$	17.41 $\pm$
			0.001

digesters with FWL at concentrations of 0.1 mg  $L^{-1}$  and 1.0 mg  $L^{-1}$  each. Sets of positive and negative controls were run with and without the addition of FWL, respectively. AD continued until the cessation of biogas production.

## 2.3. Analytical methods

The methane content of the biogas produced in the headspace of the digesters was quantified each day using a gas chromatography system (6890N, Agilent Technologies, Palo Alto, CA, USA) equipped with a Molecular Sieve 5A column. The modified Gompertz equation (Graph-Pad Prism version 9.2.0; GraphPad Software, San Diego, CA, USA) was used to calculate the methane production potential ( $M_{max}$ ), maximum methane production rate ( $R_m$ ), and lag phase ( $\lambda$ ) [50]. The intermediate concentrations of volatile fatty acids (VFAs) and SAs were estimated using the above GC equipped with an HPINNOWax column and an HPLC (Alliance 2695 system, Waters, USA) equipped with a C18 column, respectively [48,59].

## 2.4. Microbial assessment and quantification of key genes during codigestion

The taxonomic diversity of the digester microbiome was evaluated through high-throughput sequencing of 16S rRNA amplicons using the Ion GeneStudio<sup>™</sup> S5 System (catalog number: A38194; Thermo Fisher Scientific, Waltham, MA, USA). Total microbial DNA was extracted using a DNeasy PowerSoil Pro Kit (catalog number: 47016; Qiagen, Hilden, Germany) at different time periods during co-digestion and used as a template for polymerase chain reaction (PCR) and quantitative polymerase chain reaction (qPCR). PCR amplification of the extracted DNA was performed in a MiniAmp<sup>™</sup> Plus Thermal Cycler (catalog number: A37835; Thermo Fisher Scientific) prior to library preparation using the prokaryote-specific forward 341f and reverse 805r primer pair designed based on the variable regions (V3-V4) of 16S rRNA genes (Table S1) due to its overall coverage of total microbial diversity [20, 24]. Although, the use of a primer pair combination (344f-1041r/519f-806r) is considered superior for the archaeome analysis [42]. Amplified DNA samples were quantified using the Invitrogen Qubit 4 Fluorometer (Thermo Fisher Scientific) and processed for library preparation and chip loading using the Ion Chef<sup>™</sup> Instrument (catalog number: 4484177; Thermo Fisher Scientific). The operational taxonomic units representing each read were clustered by 99 % similarity against the SILVA 138 16S rRNA reference database using a confidence threshold of 0.8 to identify different microorganisms. The high-throughput sequencing data was deposited to NCBI under Bioproject: PRJNA931785 (Table S3). The 16S rRNA data were processed to compare and visualize the functional potential of the core microbiota in the exponential phase of growth based on the KEGG ortholog [51].

Relative quantification of key genes, such as *sul1*, *sul2*, and *intl1*, was performed using qPCR in an Applied Biosystems StepOne<sup>TM</sup> Real-Time PCR System (catalog number: 4376373; Thermo Fisher Scientific) using SYBR<sup>TM</sup> Green PCR Master Mix (catalog number: 4309155; Applied Biosystems, Waltham, MA, USA). Primers for key genes (Table S1) were selected based on a previous study [62] and were obtained from COSMO<sub>GENETECH</sub> (Seoul, Republic of Korea). Changes in the relative copy numbers of key genes were estimated using the  $\Delta\Delta C_T$  method in relation to the 16S rRNA amplicon used as a reference (housekeeping) gene [41].

## 2.5. Statistical analysis

Statistical significance of the experimental data was assessed using triplicate values, and standard errors of the means were calculated using GraphPad Prism version 9.2.0 for Windows. Differences between variables were detected at a confidence level of p < 0.05, and Tukey's multiple comparison test was used for statistical analysis. Correlation

analysis was performed among the major microbial phyla, sulfonamide resistance genes *sul1* and *sul2*, and *intl1* over the digestion period using Pearson coefficient (*r*) analysis conducted using the Cytoscape platform. The Pearson coefficient (*r*) study identified strong and weak correlations as r > 0.6 or r < -0.6.

## 3. Results and discussion

## 3.1. Biogas production

Continuous production of methane and hydrogen from day 1 of AD was observed during AD of FWL for 66 days in the presence of different concentrations (low: 0.1 mg  $L^{-1}$  and high: 1.0 mg  $L^{-1}$ ) of SAs (Fig. 1a, b). Hydrogen production ceased within 7 days of operation and reached a steady state in all digesters (Fig. 1b). An initial decrease in the pH of the suspension (5.8-6.0) on the fourth day in the FWL digesters indicated hydrogen production via rapid hydrolysis and acidogenesis (Fig. S1). A similar observation of an initial decrease in pH was attributed to the production of hydrogen and VFAs due to acidogenesis in previous studies [3,26]. Following the initial decrease, the pH of the suspension increased and stabilized at 7.0-7.8 for the remainder of the digestion process (Fig. S1). The pH (7.1-8.1) in the control digesters remained stable throughout the experiment. The high content of carbonaceous organic matter (carbohydrates and lipids) in FWL (Table 1) stabilizes the pH of the suspension, which is necessary for optimum methanation [49]. Methane production continued for the next 59 d without interruption and reached cumulative values of 2554–3508 mL after utilizing 75–76 % of the total VS in the FWL digesters in the presence or absence of SAs

### Table 2

Digestion efficiency and product yield. Entries are given as the mean  $\pm$  standard error of the mean of triplicate results. ND: not detected.

Parameters	Control	FWL	FWL with SAs	
			0.1 mg L <sup>-1</sup> SAs	1.0 mg L <sup>-1</sup> SAs
Total solid utilization	$\textbf{48.43} \pm$	$62.92 \pm$	62.53 $\pm$	$63.82 \pm$
(%)	0.11	0.13	0.04	0.77
Volatile solid	$61.30~\pm$	75.50 $\pm$	75.42 $\pm$	76.28 $\pm$
utilization (%)	0.16	0.27	0.17	0.51
Carbohydrate	54.52 $\pm$	64.80 $\pm$	$\textbf{68.98} \pm$	73.20 $\pm$
utilization (%)	0.24	0.19	4.56	0.98
Lipid utilization (%)	ND	68.45 $\pm$	64.17 $\pm$	69.25 $\pm$
		1.23	3.09	1.39
Yields of CH <sub>4</sub> (g g <sup>-1</sup>	0.04 $\pm$	0.33 $\pm$	0.44 $\pm$	0.45 $\pm$
VS <sub>initial</sub> )	0003	0.004	0.005	0.006
Percent yields of CH <sub>4</sub>	$\textbf{28.38} \pm$	69.97 $\pm$	94.87 $\pm$	96.12 $\pm$
	0.12	0.79	1.09	1.32
R <sub>m</sub> (mL d <sup>-1</sup> )	12.63	37.01	36.74	38.77
Energy generation (kJ)	$6.31 \pm$	92.99 $\pm$	126.09 $\pm$	127.74 $\pm$
	0.05	0.89	1.24	1.55
Energy recovery (%)	7.98 $\pm$	70.15 $\pm$	$\textbf{95.12} \pm$	96.34 $\pm$
	0.04	0.67	0.94	1.17

(Fig. 1a, Table 2). A nonlinear regression analysis of  $M_{max}$  (R<sup>2</sup>: 0.90–0.95) did not reveal any significant differences in  $R_m$  among the FWL digesters (p = 0.92–0.99) with or without SAs even at high SA concentrations (three times higher than that of the controls) (Table 2, Table S2). Biogas production and respective methane yields in anaerobic sequencing batch reactors remained stable during the loading of



Fig. 1. Cumulative methane (a) and hydrogen (b) production with respective daily methane yields (c) and methane content (d) during co-digestion for different experimental sets. The 0.1 mg  $L^{-1}$  sulfonamide antibiotics (SAs) and 1.0 mg  $L^{-1}$  SAs indicate different concentrations of SAs in digesters with food waste leachate (FWL).

antibiotic mixtures containing sulfamethoxazole  $(0.5-10 \text{ mg L}^{-1})$ , erythromycin  $(0.2-0.5 \text{ mg L}^{-1})$  and tetracycline  $(0.2-0.5 \text{ mg L}^{-1})$ , indicating antibiotic tolerance of digester microbiota at comparatively high SA loads [5].

The highest methane yield (61 mL g<sup>-1</sup> VS<sub>initial</sub>) was achieved in the FWL digester with  $0.1 \text{ mg L}^{-1}$  SAs on the 46th day of digestion, with methane comprising 80 % of the produced biogas (Fig. 1c, d). The cumulative methane yields were 37 % and 1 % higher in digesters with 1.0 mg•L<sup>-1</sup> SAs after 66 days of operation, compared to FWL (497 mL•g<sup>-1</sup> <sup>1</sup> VS<sub>initial</sub>) and 0.1 mg L<sup>-1</sup> SAs (673 mL g<sup>-1</sup> VS<sub>initial</sub>) digesters, respectively. Maximum methane production (95-96 %) in comparison to their respective theoretical yields occurred in FWL digesters containing SAs owing to the consumption of carbohydrates (69-73%) and lipids (64-69 %) present in digester VS (Table 2). During digestion, the maximum methane yields facilitated a total energy generation and recovery of 128 kJ and 96 %, respectively. Sulfamethazine was found to promote methanation (5-9 %) substantially during anaerobic sludge digestion [65]. The efficiency of acidogenesis and acetogenesis has been attributed to improved methanation (five times higher than that of the control) in sulfamethoxazole (5 mg L<sup>-1</sup>)-spiked anaerobic digesters [35]. SAs stimulated the hydrolysis of waste-activated sludge through the disruption of extracellular polymeric substances in sludge and facilitated acidogenesis and acetogenesis via anaerobes that enhance VFA production (32-173 %) during anaerobic fermentation [18,58]. SA-promoted protease,  $\alpha$ -glucosidase, and acetate kinase activities in anaerobes accelerated the hydrolysis and acidogenesis of activated sludge, which favored hydrogenotrophic methanogenesis [18,31]. Enhancement of the syntrophic association among acidogenic Clostridia and Bacteroidia and toxicant-resistant hydrogenotrophic methanogens in the presence of sulfadiazine and Fe<sup>0</sup> improved methanation (36.9 %) and pollutant degradation during anaerobic digestion of swine manure [19]. The presence of various metal ions in wastewater sludge and FW facilitates interspecies electron transfer (IET) among acidogens/acetogens and hydrogenotrophic/acetoclastic methanogens and assists in the utilization of hydrogen and VFAs, thus leading to improved methanation [47,53]. Nevertheless, statistical analysis did not reveal any significant (p > 0.99) differences in cumulative methane yields among the FWL digesters with or without SAs in this study, when calculated in terms of gmethane g<sup>-1</sup> VS<sub>initial</sub> (Table 2). Endogenous protein-degradation compounds in the inoculum have been known to limit the bacteriostatic activity of SAs in susceptible gram-positive and

gram-negative anaerobes, indicating uninterrupted digestion even at an SA concentration of 280 mg  $L^{-1}$  [39].

## 3.2. Microbial taxonomy during co-digestion

High-throughput amplicon sequencing of the digester microbiota revealed the dominance of eight major bacterial phyla and two archaeal phyla throughout the digestion period under all experimental conditions (Table S4). Among the major phyla, Actinobacteriota (14-23 %) and Firmicutes (49–72%) were dominant during the phase shift of digestion in their respective digesters, followed by Chloroflexi and Proteobacteria (Fig. 2). The populations of Chloroflexi and Proteobacteria showed a declining tendency in consecutive digestion phases when compared to the microbiota of the initial ADS. However, these changes were not statistically significant (p > 0.99). The predominant acidogenic and acetogenic abilities of members of these phyla favored their proliferation during AD of carbohydrate- and lipid-rich FWL [48,49]. The population of pathogenic Mycobacterium in the phylum Actinobacteriota reached 12 % during the exponential phase in digesters with 0.1 mg•L<sup>-1</sup> SAs and were the most abundant among major genera across all experimental sets (Fig. 3). The high potential of Mycobacterium for developing resistance to numerous antibiotics could explain its presence in all digesters with SAs [2]. Romboutsia in the phylum Firmicutes was the most abundant (4-6 %), followed by Clostridium sensu stricto 7 (2-5 %) in FWL digesters with and without SAs (Fig. 3). However, the population of Clostridium sensu stricto 7 decreased with increasing SA concentrations during the exponential phase compared to populations in digesters without SAs. Populations of Clostridium sensu stricto 1 (2-5 %) and Terrisporobacter (5-7%) were high in digesters with the highest SA concentration  $(1.0 \text{ mg L}^{-1})$  throughout the digestion period (Fig. 3). The xylanolytic, amylolytic, and glycolytic activities of Romboutsia, Clostridium, and Terrisporobacter, respectively, probably assisted their proliferation during FWL digestion [66]. These genera are pathogenic and cause intestinal inflammation and disrupt gut homeostasis in humans and animals [17,44].

After their initial suppression, *Syntrophomonas* and *Turicibacter* in the phylum Firmicutes rapidly increased by 2–5 fold and 1.4–1.6 fold, respectively, during the late exponential phase in FWL digesters with and without SAs (Fig. 3). The members of these genera were sensitive to SAs, as indicated by the decreasing trends of their population as SA concentrations increased in the digesters. Enrichment of acetogenic



**Fig. 2.** Diversity in the core microbiota at the s level during co-digestion for different experimental sets. The 0.1 mg L<sup>-1</sup> sulfonamide antibiotics (SAs) and 1.0 mg L<sup>-1</sup> SAs indicate different concentrations of SAs in digesters with food waste leachate (FWL).



Fig. 3. Diversity in bacterial genera (abundance > 0.2) during co-digestion for different experimental sets. The 0.1 mg L<sup>-1</sup> sulfonamide antibiotics (SAs) and 1.0 mg L<sup>-1</sup> SAs indicate different concentrations of SAs in digesters with food waste leachate (FWL).

Syntrophomonas has been shown to induce syntrophic methanation through  $\beta$ -oxidization of lipidic substrates and control electron flux among exoelectrogenic partners during AD [26,51]. In this study, the populations of Patescibacteria (0.5–0.6 %), Planctomycetota (0.7–1 %), and Verrucomicrobiota (0.5-0.7 %) increased during the early exponential phase following their initial abundance in ADS (0.1-0.3 %) and declined thereafter (Fig. 3). In contrast, the population of Synergistota exhibited a V-shaped recovery during the stationary phase (0.7-0.9 %) after a steady decline in the exponential phase (0.1–0.3 %). Incremental increases in the population of Aminobacterium (0.2-04%) during the late exponential phase led to the recovery of Synergistota. The protein content of FWL supports the growth of the amino acid-utilizing Aminobacterium (Table 1) [51]. The acetogenic activity of members of the phylum Synergistota (especially Aminobacterium) probably contributes to its late recovery facilitated by syntrophic interactions with acetoclastic/hydrogenotrophic methanogens [25]. The population of Bacteroidetes vadinHA17 in the phylum Bacteroidota increased during the stationary phase after an initial inhibition (Fig. 3). Bacteroidetes vadinHA17 can degrade 16-17 types of amino acids in proteinaceous substrates owing to their amylolytic activities, which support their growth in the stationary phase [36]. Halobacteriota was the most dominant among the archaeal phyla and reached an abundance of 0.7-1.4 % at the end of the digestion process in the FWL digesters (Fig. 2). In the FWL

digesters, Halobacteriota exhibited an initial decline compared to the control digesters during the early exponential phase; however, the population recovered steadily as digestion progressed. Rapid acidogenesis and acetogenesis could account for this decline via VFA accumulation, which was not sustained due to the methanogenic potential to utilize VFAs and SAs [22,62].

Methanosaeta (phylum: Halobacteriota) was predominant (89-96 %) among the methanogens during the early exponential phase in the FWL digesters and declined to 47-53 % as digestion progressed (Fig. 4). Methanogenic dominance shifted towards Methanosarcina (40 %) in digesters with the highest SA concentration at the end of digestion. The tolerance of Methanosarcina to high acetate concentrations enables their survival during SA-mediated acidosis [26]. Selection pressure by tetracyclines and sulfonamides in anaerobic sludge digestion in continuous stirred-tank digesters shifted the microbiota towards the more versatile Methanosarcinales through VFA accumulation [60]. Nevertheless, Methanosarcinales (Methanosarcina and Methanosaeta) can create syntrophic associations with acidogens/acetogens and exoelectrogens to oxidize acetate and reduce carbon dioxide for methanation during AD [47]. Another study showed that interspecies interactions among acidogenic members of the phyla Firmicutes (Clostridium sensu stricto, Ruminococcaceae, Clostridium III: ~5 %) and Bacteroidota (Bacteroidales: 5 %) and Methanosarcina increased methanation (21.5 %)



Fig. 4. Methanogenic abundance during co-digestion for different experimental sets. The 0.1 mg L<sup>-1</sup> sulfonamide antibiotics (SAs) and 1.0 mg L<sup>-1</sup> SAs indicate different concentrations of SAs in digesters with food waste leachate (FWL). ND: not detected.

through IET during the AD of swine manure [30]. In the present study, hydrogenotrophic methanation was performed primarily by Methanobrevibacter (13-19%) in FWL digesters with and without SAs during the exponential phase, which was overpowered by Methanobacterium (15-33 %), Methanoculleus (10-14 %), and Methanofollis (3-5 %) at the end of digestion (Fig. 4). The dominance of Methanoculleus and Methanofollis in the stationary phase suggested syntrophic associations between acetate oxidizers and hydrogenotrophic methanogens during the AD of lipidic FWL and slaughterhouse waste [7,51]. Hydrogenotrophic methanogens such as Methanomassiliicoccus, Methanoculleus, Methanosphaera, and Methanobrevibacter comprise 86 % of the archaeal population in sulfadiazine-containing digesters [19]. The presence of sulfamethoxazole in anaerobic digesters increased hydrogen partial pressure ( $>10^{-4}$  atm), which triggered hydrogenotrophic methanation over the acetoclastic pathway by inhibiting the oxidation of VFAs butyrate) acetate [35]. (propionate, to Nevertheless. Methanosarcinales-mediated acetoclastic methanogenesis played a prominent role in methanation during FWL digestion with/without SAs, regardless of the SA concentrations studied.

## 3.3. Dissemination of antibiotic resistance through ARMs

The relative copy numbers of the sulfonamide drug resistance genes (sul1 and sul2) were low during the exponential phase when compared to their respective controls (initial phase) in all digesters, but this was not the case for the class 1 integron gene (intl1) (Fig. 5a, b). The increase in sul2 was inversely proportional to the SAs concentration, whereas sul1 levels were independent of SAs concentrations in all experimental phases. The relatively low abundance of sul1 throughout the anaerobic sludge digestion could be explained by its low sensitivity to antibiotic pressure [6]. The increase in the relative copy numbers of sul genes in the FWL digesters with or without SAs at various concentrations suggests that the transfer of resistance genes and proliferation of ARMs occurred during the stationary phase (Fig. 5b). Exposure to sulfamethoxazole assists the proliferation of sulfamethoxazole-resistant gram-negative bacteria in dewatered sludge [12]. Microbial exposure to sulfamethizole and sulfadiazine during AD of pig manure suggested enrichment of sul-genes-containing ARMs in environmental bodies after the application of digested sludge to the soil [11]. Long-term exposure to antibiotics has been shown to cause intrinsic microbial resistance to tetracycline and sulfonamide and promote the proliferation of ARMs in anaerobically digested sludge [60]. The relative abundances of pathogenic Anaerovorax, Clostridium, Mycobacterium, Romboutsia, Terrisporobacter, and Turicibacter indicate the dissemination of sul genes and proliferation of ARMs during the exponential and stationary phases of AD (Fig. 3). The pathogenicity of members of Anaerovorax, Clostridium, Mycobacterium, and Romboutsia and their syntrophic interactions with members of Terrisporobacter and Turicibacter lead to inflammation and antibiotic-resistant infections in humans [17,44,8].

The presence of a comparatively high copy number of *intl1* in the FWL digesters suggests that dissemination of MGEs in the experimental digesters occurred because of HGT in FWL microbiota during digestion (Fig. 5a). The abundance of ARGs in FW provides an optimum environment for the transmission of ARGs, especially sul1 and sul2, across pathogenic ARMs via HGT [21,32]. Levels of the class 1 integron gene intl1 were high in the experimental digesters throughout the digestion period (Fig. 5a, b). As an MGE, intl1 plays a major role in the dissemination of sul genes (i.e., sul1 and sul2) among similar and diverse microbial genera through VGT and HGT in both chromosomes and plasmids [21]. The high prevalence rate of the sul1 gene in anaerobic membrane bioreactors was associated with the abundance of intl1, highlighting its importance in *sul* dissemination [62]. The co-occurrence of intl1 and sul1 suggests that HGT-mediated transmission of ARGs occurred during AD [32]. The abundance of sul1 and sul2 in Escherichia coli plasmids carrying intl1 suggested that HGT is the dominant route of transmission for sul genes [21]. The formation of biofilms in digested sludge promotes the development of spatiotemporal reserves for plasmid-carrying ARMs, which outnumber plasmid-free ARMs [45]. Additionally, the selection pressure for potential hosts and their adaptive proliferation resulted in the dissemination of various ARGs, especially sul1, tetA, sul2, tetW, and tetM during anaerobic sludge digestion under the influence of antibiotic mixtures containing tetracycline, oxytetracycline, chlortetracycline, and various SAs at 2 mg L<sup>-1</sup> independent of intl1-based HGT [6]. Similarly, the maximum increase in the copy number of sul2 observed during the stationary phase indicated intl1-independent transmission of ARGs and proliferation of ARMs in the FWL digesters (Fig. 5b).

## 3.4. Microbial correlations and their metabolic activities

The correlation matrices revealed significant (p < 0.05) interactions among the five dominant microbial phyla (Chloroflexi, Firmicutes, Patescibacteria, Proteobacteria, and Synergistota), *sul* genes, and *intl*1 (Fig. 6a and S2a, b). The significant interaction of *intl*1 with *sul*1



**Fig. 5.** Changes in the relative copy numbers of sulfonamide drug resistance genes *sul1* and *sul2*, and class 1 integron gene *intl1* in digesters with food waste leachate (FWL) compared to control (a) and other experimental sets compared to those in the digesters with FWL (b) during co-digestion. The 0.1 mg L<sup>-1</sup> SAs and 1.0 mg L<sup>-1</sup> SAs indicate different concentrations of SAs in digesters with FWL.

indicated that intl1-dependent HGT is probably responsible for the transmission of *sul1*, while the transmission of *sul2* primarily occurs via an intl1-independent route. This could be explained by the ability of sul1 to be accommodated by small conjugative plasmids allowing its dissemination through intl1-based plasmids, whereas sul2 is primarily carried by large plasmids with limited mobility [62]. Nevertheless, intl1-independent transmission of both sul1 and sul2 was possible in members of the phylum Synergistota (Fig. 6a). Increases in the population of Synergistota\_Uncultured, copy numbers of sul genes, and ARM proliferation during the stationary phase confirm this interaction (Fig. 5b and S3). Bacteroidota, Firmicutes, Proteobacteria, and Synergistota are potentially responsible for the dissemination of ARGs [32]. Members of the phyla Firmicutes and Chloroflexi closely interacted with sul1 during the exponential phase of AD, an interaction that shifted to Patescibacteria in the stationary phase along with intl1 (Fig. S2a, b). The abundance of pathogenic genera in Firmicutes and Chloroflexi suggests the accommodation of sul1 among the members of these phyla (Fig. 3 and S3). The shifting of the microbial community to Chloroflexi and Firmicutes was reported to be responsible for the transformation of the soil resistome through the enrichment of 108 ARGs [9]. Ultra-small parasitic bacteria Saccharimonadales of the phylum Patescibacteria

aided *intl1*-based HGT during the stationary phase (Fig. 3). Therefore, the dissemination of ARGs during AD depends on the potential of certain bacteria to accommodate specific types of ARGs through *intl1*-dependent HGT or *intl1*-independent transmission.

Methanogenic archaea were shielded against any possible interactions with sul genes and intl1 (Fig. 6a and S2a), allowing uninterrupted methanation during the AD (Fig. 1). The ability of versatile Methanosaeta and Methanosarcina in the digesters to perform both acetoclastic and hydrogenotrophic methanogenesis shielded members of the phylum Halobacteriota from the influence of ARGs (Fig. 4). Methanogenic archaea exhibit the least sensitivity to SAs during AD and can utilize SAs as a cosubstrate, which explains their low inherent risk to develop antibiotic resistance [31,62]. Notably, major acetoclastic methanogens within Halobacteriota exhibited syntrophy with members of Bacteroidota and Patescibacteria instead of with other major bacterial phyla (Fig. 6a and S2a). Euryarchaeota, which include hydrogenotrophic methanogens such as Methanobacterium and Methanobrevibacter, established positive interactions with acidogenic and acetogenic Bacteroidota, Firmicutes, and Proteobacteria. The population increases of Methanobrevibacter and Methanobacterium during the exponential and stationary phases, respectively, are indicative of their correlation (Fig. 4). The hydrogen-scavenging abilities of Methanobacterium and Methanobrevibacter during the acidogenic and acetogenic processes sustained a low hydrogen partial pressure (<2 Pa) in the digesters, which favored methanogenesis [47].

KEGG ortholog analysis was used to explore the functional potency of the core microbiota during the exponential phase (Fig. 6b). The gene expression of ABC transporters (17-23 %) and genes involved in fat digestion and absorption pathways (16–34 %) were the highest among major metabolic activities in FWL digesters, followed by those involved in carbohydrate and protein digestion and absorption; butanoate, propanoate, and pyruvate metabolism; glycolysis gluconeogenesis; the citrate cycle (TCA cycle); and pentose phosphate pathway. Rapid digestion of carbohydrates, proteins, and lipids in FWL and active nutrient (e.g., acetate) transport to microbial cells for methanation accelerates the metabolic expression of these pathways [51]. Riboflavin metabolism and quorum sensing increased by 5-20 % and 2-13 %, respectively, in the FWL digesters (Fig. 6b). Induction of riboflavin metabolism and quorum sensing indicates the activity of the riboflavin cofactor during syntrophic VFA oxidation and methanation by core microbiota and their interactions through quorum sensing [46,64]. Methane metabolism did not exhibit any significant differences (p > 0.05) among the digesters as no inhibition was observed in any of the digesters during AD (Figs. 1 and 6b). Cationic antimicrobial peptide (CAMP) resistance emerged as the main resistance category, followed by vancomycin and  $\beta$ -lactam resistance during the exponential phase (Fig. 6b). Alanine, aspartate, and glutamate metabolism accounted for the increased expression of CAMP resistance, as the incorporation of D-alanine in the lipoteichoic acids of the bacterial membrane is vital for the reduction of membrane negativity, which facilitates the development of resistance in Bacillus, Clostridium, and Lactobacillus spp. Assoni et al., (year) [4]. The development of  $\beta$ -lactam resistance and absence of SA-mediated bacterial inhibition during AD suggest the presence of multidrug resistance gene-containing plasmids in the core microbiota, which could encode extended-spectrum  $\beta$ -lactamases along with other resistance genes that could confer resistance against  $\beta$ -lactams and several non- $\beta$ -lactam antibiotics, such as aminoglycosides, fluoroquinolones, and sulfamethoxazole-trimethoprim [10]. Thus, the presence of SAs accelerated the transformation of core digester microbiota to ARMs during AD.

## 4. Conclusions

The addition of SAs enhanced cumulative methane yields in the FWL digesters by 37 % compared to FWL digesters without SAs by inducing the proliferation of hydrolytic, acidogenic, and acetogenic bacteria of



**Fig. 6.** Correlation matrix (Pearson's correlation coefficients > 0.6 and p < 0.05) among major microbial phyla, sulfonamide drug resistance genes *sul1* and *sul2*, and class 1 integron gene *intl1* over the digestion period (a) and changes in major metabolic activities during the exponential phase of different digestion sets (b). Differences in thickness represent variation in significant correlations (r > 0.6 or r < -0.6).

the phyla Actinobacteriota, Bacteroidota, Chloroflexi, Firmicutes, Proteobacteria, and Synergistota, which rapidly utilized substrates during AD. This microbial shift accelerated substrate digestion and absorption through active transport; butanoate, propanoate, and pyruvate metabolism; glycolysis gluconeogenesis; the citrate cycle (TCA cycle); and the pentose phosphate pathway. Versatile Methanosarcinales (Methanosaeta and Methanosarcina) played a predominant role in methanation through acetoclastic methanogenesis. The induction of riboflavin metabolism and quorum sensing established syntrophy among VFA oxidizers and methanogenic archaea. Syntrophic associations of hydrogenotrophic methanogens with their acidogenic and acetogenic partners in the phyla Bacteroidota, Firmicutes, and Proteobacteria stabilized the digester performance for improved methanation. The coexistence of intl1 and sul1 genes in the pathogenic members of the phyla Chloroflexi, Firmicutes, and Patescibacteria facilitated intl1-based HGT of ARGs and proliferation of ARMs during AD. The transmission of sul2 was independent of intl1 dissemination among the Synergistota. The performance of methanogenic archaea was not affected by SAs, regardless of the antibiotic concentrations, and methanogens were shielded against any interactions with sul genes or intl1. The emergence of CAMP, vancomycin, and  $\beta$ -lactam resistance in the core microbiota of the digesters suggests bacterial transformation towards multidrug resistance during SA-spiked AD of FWL. Thus, the presence of SAs in wastewater sludge could enrich environmental resistomes through the transformation of digester microbiota during AD despite improved digester performance.

#### **Environmental Implication**

Sulfonamide antibiotics are frequently detected in the influents and effluents of wastewater treatment plants worldwide because of their refractory characteristics, which exert selection pressure towards vertical and horizontal gene transfer among and across bacterial populations and intensify the emergence of antibiotic-resistant microorganisms. This study elucidates the dissemination patterns of antibiotic resistance genes (ARGs) among the members of core microbiota during anaerobic digestion of food waste leachate and the performance of core microbiota under various sulfonamide antibiotics pressure. The observed development of multidrug resistance in the digester microbiota probably occurred during digestion due to ARG transfer, although methanogens appeared unaffected from such transfer phenomena leading to antibiotic resistance.

## CRediT authorship contribution statement

Shouvik Saha: Conceptualization, Methodology, Validation, Data analysis, Investigation, Data curation, Visualization, Funding acquisition, Project administration, Writing – original draft, oreview, & editing. Jiu-Qiang Xiong: Data analysis, Investigation, Data curation, Writing – review & editing. Swapnil M. Patil: High-throughput sequencing and data analysis. Geon-Soo Ha: Writing – review & editing. Jeong-Kyu Hoh: Writing – review & editing. Hyun-Kyung Park: Funding acquisition, Project administration. Woojin Chung: Writing – review & editing. Soon Woong Chang: Writing – review & editing. Moonis Ali Khan: Writing – review & editing. Ho Bum Park: Writing – review & editing. Byong-Hun Jeon: Resources, Funding acquisition, Supervision, Writing – review & editing.

#### **Declaration of Competing Interest**

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

## Data Availability

Data will be made available on request.

#### Acknowledgments

This work was supported by the Medicine-Engineering-Bio (MEB) research fund (HY-20200000002809) of Hanyang University, Seoul, Republic of Korea and the Researchers Supporting Project (RSP2023R345) of King Saud University, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia and the Mid-Career Research Support Program (202200000000492 and 2022R1A5A1032539) through the National Research Foundation (NRF) of the Ministry of Education, Science, and Technology, Republic of Korea.

## Appendix A. Supporting information

Supplementary data associated with this article can be found in the online version at doi:10.1016/j.jhazmat.2023.131200.

#### References

- [1] Adelowo, O.O., Helbig, T., Knecht, C., Reincke, F., Mäusezahl, I., Müller, J.A., 2018. High abundances of class 1 integrase and sulfonamide resistance genes, and characterisation of class 1 integron gene cassettes in four urban wetlands in Nigeria. PLoS One 13 (11), e0208269. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal. pone.0208269.
- [2] Allué-Guardia, A., García, J.I., Torrelles, J.B., 2021. Evolution of drug-resistant mycobacterium tuberculosis strains and their adaptation to the human lung environment. Front Microbiol 12, 612675. https://doi.org/10.3389/ fmicb.2021.612675.
- [3] Angenent, L.T., Karim, K., Al-Dahhan, M.H., Domiguez-Espinosa, R., 2004. Production of bioenergy and biochemicals from industrial and agricultural wastewater. Trends Biotechnol 22 (9), 477–485. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. tibtech.2004.07.001.
- [4] Assoni, L., Milani, B., Carvalho, M.R., Nepomuceno, L.N., Waz, N.T., Guerra, M.E. S., et al., 2020. Resistance mechanisms to antimicrobial peptides in gram-positive bacteria. Front Microbiol 11, 593215. https://doi.org/10.3389/ fmicb.2020.593215.
- [5] Aydin, S., Ince, B., Cetecioglu, Z., Arikan, O., Ozbayram, E.G., Shahi, A., et al., 2015. Combined effect of erythromycin, tetracycline and sulfamethoxazole on performance of anaerobic sequencing batch reactors. Bioresour Technol 186, 207–214. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2015.03.043.
  [6] Bai, Y., Xu, R., Wang, Q.-P., Zhang, Y.-R., Yang, Z.-H., 2019. Sludge anaerobic
- [6] Bai, Y., Xu, R., Wang, Q.-P., Zhang, Y.-R., Yang, Z.-H., 2019. Sludge anaerobic digestion with high concentrations of tetracyclines and sulfonamides: Dynamics of microbial communities and change of antibiotic resistance genes. Bioresour Technol 276, 51–59. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2018.12.066.
- [7] Basak, B., Patil, S.M., Saha, S., Kurade, M.B., Ha, G.-S., Govindwar, S.P., et al., 2021. Rapid recovery of methane yield in organic overloaded-failed anaerobic digesters through bioaugmentation with acclimatized microbial consortium. Sci Total Environ 764, 144219. https://doi.org/10.1016/i.sciteny.2020.144219.
- Total Environ 764, 144219. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.144219.
  [8] Bessis, S., Ndongo, S., Lagier, J.C., Fournier, P.E., Raoult, D., 2016. "Emergencia timonensis," a new bacterium isolated from the stool of a healthy patient. N Microbes N Infect 12, 73–75. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nmni.2016.05.001.
- [9] Chen, Q., An, X., Li, H., Su, J., Ma, Y., Zhu, Y.-G., 2016. Long-term field application of sewage sludge increases the abundance of antibiotic resistance genes in soil. Environ Int 92–93, 1–10. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envint.2016.03.026.
- [10] Farrag, H.A., Abdallah, N., Shehata, M.M.K., Awad, E.M., 2019. Natural outer membrane permeabilizers boost antibiotic action against irradiated resistant bacteria. J Biomed Sci 26 (1), 69. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12929-019-0561-6.
- [11] Feng, L., Casas, M.E., Ottosen, L.D.M., Møller, H.B., Bester, K., 2017. Removal of antibiotics during the anaerobic digestion of pig manure. Sci Total Environ 603–604, 219–225. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2017.05.280.
- [12] Gao, P., Munir, M., Xagoraraki, I., 2012. Correlation of tetracycline and sulfonamide antibiotics with corresponding resistance genes and resistant bacteria in a conventional municipal wastewater treatment plant. Sci Total Environ 421–422, 173–183. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2012.01.061.
- [13] Han, X.-M., Hu, H.-W., Chen, Q.-L., Yang, L.-Y., Li, H.-L., Zhu, Y.-G., et al., 2018. Antibiotic resistance genes and associated bacterial communities in agricultural soils amended with different sources of animal manures. Soil Biol Biochem 126, 91–102. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2018.08.018.
- [14] Harb, M., Lou, E., Smith, A.L., Stadler, L.B., 2019. Perspectives on the fate of micropollutants in mainstream anaerobic wastewater treatment. Curr Opin Biotechnol 57, 94–100. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.copbio.2019.02.022.
- [15] He, P., Yu, Z., Shao, L., Zhou, Y., Lü, F., 2019. Fate of antibiotics and antibiotic resistance genes in a full-scale restaurant food waste treatment plant: implications of the roles beyond heavy metals and mobile genetic elements. J Environ Sci 85, 17–34. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jes.2019.04.004.

- [16] Hsu, J., 2020. How covid-19 is accelerating the threat of antimicrobial resistance. BMJ 369, m1983. https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.m1983.
- [17] Hu, C., Niu, X., Chen, S., Wen, J., Bao, M., Mohyuddin, S.G., et al., 2021. A comprehensive analysis of the colonic flora diversity, short chain fatty acid metabolism, transcripts, and biochemical indexes in heat-stressed pigs. Front Immunol 12, 717723. https://doi.org/10.3389/fimmu.2021.717723.
- [18] Hu, J., Xu, Q., Li, X., Wang, D., Zhong, Y., Zhao, J., et al., 2018. Sulfamethazine (SMZ) affects fermentative short-chain fatty acids production from waste activated sludge. Sci Total Environ 639, 1471–1479. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. scitotenv.2018.05.264.
- [19] Huang, W., Yang, F., Huang, W., Lei, Z., Zhang, Z., 2019. Enhancing hydrogenotrophic activities by zero-valent iron addition as an effective method to improve sulfadiazine removal during anaerobic digestion of swine manure. Bioresour Technol 294, 122178. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2019.122178.
- [20] Hugerth, L.W., Pereira, M., Zha, Y., Seifert, M., Kaldhusdal, V., Boulund, F., et al., 2020. Assessment of *in vitro* and *in silico* protocols for sequence-based characterization of the human vaginal microbiome. mSphere 5 (6), e00448–00420. https://doi.org/10.1128/mSphere.00448-20.
- [21] Jiang, H., Cheng, H., Liang, Y., Yu, S., Yu, T., Fang, J., et al., 2019. Diverse mobile genetic elements and conjugal transferability of sulfonamide resistance genes (sul1, sul2, and sul3) in Escherichia coli Isolates From Penaeus vannamei and Pork From Large Markets in Zhejiang, China. Front Microbiol 10, 1787. https://doi.org/ 10.3389/fmicb.2019.01787.
- [22] Kang, D., Saha, S., Kurade, M.B., Basak, B., Ha, G.S., Jeon, B.H., et al., 2021. Dualstage pulse-feed operation enhanced methanation of lipidic waste during codigestion using acclimatized consortia. Renew Sustain Energy Rev 145, 111096. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rser.2021.111096.
- [23] Karkman, A., Do, T.T., Walsh, F., Virta, M.P.J., 2018. Antibiotic-resistance genes in waste water. Trends Microbiol 26 (3), 220–228. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. tim.2017.09.005.
- [24] Klindworth, A., Pruesse, E., Schweer, T., Peplies, J., Quast, C., Horn, M., et al., 2012. Evaluation of general 16S ribosomal RNA gene PCR primers for classical and next-generation sequencing-based diversity studies. Nucleic Acids Res 41 (1), 1–11. https://doi.org/10.1093/nar/gks808.
- [25] Kurade, M.B., Saha, S., Kim, J.R., Roh, H.-S., Jeon, B.-H., 2020. Microbial community acclimatization for enhancement in the methane productivity of anaerobic co-digestion of fats, oil, and grease. Bioresour Technol 296, 122294. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2019.122294.
- [26] Kurade, M.B., Saha, S., Salama, E.-S., Patil, S.M., Govindwar, S.P., Jeon, B.-H., 2019. Acetoclastic methanogenesis led by *Methanosarcina* in anaerobic co-digestion of fats, oil and grease for enhanced production of methane. Bioresour Technol 272, 351–359. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2018.10.047.
- [27] Lee, D.H., Behera, S.K., Kim, J.W., Park, H.-S., 2009. Methane production potential of leachate generated from Korean food waste recycling facilities: a lab-scale study. Waste Manag (Oxf) 29 (2), 876–882. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. wasman.2008.06.033.
- [28] Lee, J., Shin, S.G., Jang, H.M., Kim, Y.B., Lee, J., Kim, Y.M., 2017. Characterization of antibiotic resistance genes in representative organic solid wastes: Food wasterecycling wastewater, manure, and sewage sludge. Sci Total Environ 579, 1692–1698. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2016.11.187.
- [29] Lin, H., Zhang, J., Chen, H., Wang, J., Sun, W., Zhang, X., et al., 2017. Effect of temperature on sulfonamide antibiotics degradation, and on antibiotic resistance determinants and hosts in animal manures. Sci Total Environ 607–608, 725–732. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2017.07.057.
- [30] Lu, T., Zhang, J., Li, P., Shen, P., Wei, Y., 2020. Enhancement of methane production and antibiotic resistance genes reduction by ferrous chloride during anaerobic digestion of swine manure. Bioresour Technol 298, 122519. https://doi. org/10.1016/j.biortech.2019.122519.
- [31] Luo, J., Zhang, Q., Zhao, J., Wu, Y., Wu, L., Li, H., et al., 2020. Potential influences of exogenous pollutants occurred in waste activated sludge on anaerobic digestion: a review. J Hazard Mater 383, 121176. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. jhazmat.2019.121176.
- [32] Ma, J., Wang, P., Gu, W., Su, Y., Wei, H., Xie, B., 2021. Does lipid stress affect performance, fate of antibiotic resistance genes and microbial dynamics during anaerobic digestion of food waste. Sci Total Environ 756, 143846. https://doi.org/ 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.143846.
- [33] Ma, Y., Wilson, C.A., Novak, J.T., Riffat, R., Aynur, S., Murthy, S., et al., 2011. Effect of various sludge digestion conditions on sulfonamide, macrolide, and tetracycline resistance genes and class I integrons. Environ Sci Technol 45 (18), 7855–7861. https://doi.org/10.1021/es200827t.
- [34] Martín-Pozo, L., de Alarcón-Gómez, B., Rodríguez-Gómez, R., García-Córcoles, M. T., Çipa, M., Zafra-Gómez, A., 2019. Analytical methods for the determination of emerging contaminants in sewage sludge samples. A review. Talanta 192, 508–533. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.talanta.2018.09.056.
- [35] Mazzurco Miritana, V., Massini, G., Visca, A., Grenni, P., Patrolecco, L., Spataro, F., et al., 2020. Effects of sulfamethoxazole on the microbial community dynamics during the anaerobic digestion process. Front Microbiol 11, 537783. https://doi. org/10.3389/fmicb.2020.537783.
- [36] Mei, R., Nobu, M.K., Narihiro, T., Liu, W.-T., 2020. Metagenomic and metatranscriptomic analyses revealed uncultured bacteroidales populations as the dominant proteolytic amino acid degraders in anaerobic digesters. Front Microbiol 11, 593006. https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2020.593006.
- [37] Mezemir Damtie, M., Lee, J., Shin, J., Shin, S.G., Son, H., Wang, J., et al., 2022. Identification of factors affecting removal of antibiotic resistance genes in full-scale anaerobic digesters treating organic solid wastes. Bioresour Technol, 126929. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2022.126929.

- [38] Michael, I., Rizzo, L., McArdell, C.S., Manaia, C.M., Merlin, C., Schwartz, T., et al., 2013. Urban wastewater treatment plants as hotspots for the release of antibiotics in the environment: a review. Water Res 47 (3), 957–995. https://doi.org/ 10.1016/j.watres.2012.11.027.
- [39] Mitchell, S.M., Ullman, J.L., Teel, A.L., Watts, R.J., Frear, C., 2013. The effects of the antibiotics ampicillin, florfenicol, sulfamethazine, and tylosin on biogas production and their degradation efficiency during anaerobic digestion. Bioresour Technol 149, 244–252. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2013.09.048.
- [40] Ouyang, W.-Y., Birkigt, J., Richnow, H.H., Adrian, L., 2021. Anaerobic transformation and detoxification of sulfamethoxazole by sulfate-reducing enrichments and Desulfovibrio vulgaris. Environ Sci Technol 55 (1), 271–282. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.est.0c03407.
- [41] Patil, S.M., Kurade, M.B., Basak, B., Saha, S., Jang, M., Kim, S.-H., et al., 2021. Anaerobic co-digester microbiome during food waste valorization reveals *Methanosaeta* mediated methanogenesis with improved carbohydrate and lipid metabolism. Bioresour Technol 332, 125123. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. biortech.2021.125123.
- [42] Pausan, M.R., Csorba, C., Singer, G., Till, H., Schöpf, V., Santigli, E., et al., 2019. Exploring the archaeome: detection of archaeal signatures in the human body. Front Microbiol 10. https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2019.02796.
- [43] Qiao, M., Ying, G.-G., Singer, A.C., Zhu, Y.-G., 2018. Review of antibiotic resistance in China and its environment. Environ Int 110, 160–172. https://doi.org/10.1016/ j.envint.2017.10.016.
- [44] Ricaboni, D., Mailhe, M., Khelaifia, S., Raoult, D., Million, M., 2016. Romboutsia timonensis, a new species isolated from human gut. N Microbes N Infect 12, 6–7. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nmni.2016.04.001.
- [45] Røder, H.L., Trivedi, U., Russel, J., Kragh, K.N., Herschend, J., Thalsø-Madsen, I., et al., 2021. Biofilms can act as plasmid reserves in the absence of plasmid specific selection. npj Biofilms Microb 7 (1), 78. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41522-021-00249-w.
- [46] Rowland, I., Gibson, G., Heinken, A., Scott, K., Swann, J., Thiele, I., et al., 2018. Gut microbiota functions: metabolism of nutrients and other food components. Eur J Nutr 57 (1), 1–24. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00394-017-1445-8.
- [47] Saha, S., Basak, B., Hwang, J.-H., Salama, E.-S., Chatterjee, P.K., Jeon, B.-H., 2020. Microbial symbiosis: a network towards biomethanation. Trends Microbiol 28 (12), 968–984. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tim.2020.03.012.
- [48] Saha, S., Jeon, B.-H., Kurade, M.B., Chatterjee, P.K., Chang, S.W., Markkandan, K., et al., 2019. Microbial acclimatization to lipidic-waste facilitates the efficacy of acidogenic fermentation. Chem Eng J 358, 188–196. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. cej.2018.09.220.
- [49] Saha, S., Jeon, B.-H., Kurade, M.B., Govindwar, S.P., Chatterjee, P.K., Oh, S.-E., et al., 2019. Interspecies microbial nexus facilitated methanation of polysaccharidic wastes. Bioresour Technol 289, 121638. https://doi.org/10.1016/ j.biortech.2019.121638.
- [50] Saha, S., Jeon, B.-H., Kurade, M.B., Jadhav, S.B., Chatterjee, P.K., Chang, S.W., et al., 2018. Optimization of dilute acetic acid pretreatment of mixed fruit waste for increased methane production. J Clean Prod 190, 411–421. https://doi.org/ 10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.04.193.
- [51] Saha, S., Kurade, M.B., Ha, G.-S., Lee, S.S., Roh, H.-S., Park, Y.-K., et al., 2021. Syntrophic metabolism facilitates *Methanosarcina*-led methanation in the anaerobic digestion of lipidic slaughterhouse waste. Bioresour Technol 335, 125250. https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2021.125250.
- [52] Schar, D., Klein, E.Y., Laxminarayan, R., Gilbert, M., Van Boeckel, T.P., 2020. Global trends in antimicrobial use in aquaculture. Sci Rep -Uk 10 (1), 21878. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-020-78849-3.
- [53] Shamurad, B., Sallis, P., Petropoulos, E., Tabraiz, S., Ospina, C., Leary, P., et al., 2020. Stable biogas production from single-stage anaerobic digestion of food

waste. Appl Energy 263, 114609. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. apenergy.2020.114609.

- [54] Sun, C., Li, W., Chen, Z., Qin, W., Wen, X., 2019. Responses of antibiotics, antibiotic resistance genes, and mobile genetic elements in sewage sludge to thermal hydrolysis pre-treatment and various anaerobic digestion conditions. Environ Int 133, 105156. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envint.2019.105156.
- [55] Tran, N.H., Reinhard, M., Gin, K.Y.-H., 2018. Occurrence and fate of emerging contaminants in municipal wastewater treatment plants from different geographical regions-a review. Water Res 133, 182–207. https://doi.org/10.1016/ j.watres.2017.12.029.
- [56] Wang, S., O'Connor, L., Wang, Z., Jiang, Y., Morris, D., Cahill, N., et al., 2020. Inactivation of carbapenemase-producing Enterobacterales during anaerobic codigestion of food waste and pig manure. Bioresour Technol Rep 11, 100455. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biteb.2020.100455.
- [57] Wei, C.-H., Sanchez-Huerta, C., Leiknes, T., Amy, G., Zhou, H., Hu, X., et al., 2019. Removal and biotransformation pathway of antibiotic sulfamethoxazole from municipal wastewater treatment by anaerobic membrane bioreactor. J Hazard Mater 380, 120894. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2019.120894.
- [58] Xie, J., Duan, X., Feng, L., Yan, Y., Wang, F., Dong, H., et al., 2019. Influence of sulfadiazine on anaerobic fermentation of waste activated sludge for volatile fatty acids production: focusing on microbial responses. Chemosphere 219, 305–312. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2018.12.015.
- [59] Xiong, J.-Q., Kim, S.-J., Kurade, M.B., Govindwar, S., Abou-Shanab, R.A.I., Kim, J.-R., et al., 2019. Combined effects of sulfamethazine and sulfamethoxazole on a freshwater microalga, Scenedesmus obliquus: toxicity, biodegradation, and metabolic fate. J Hazard Mater 370, 138–146. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. jhazmat.2018.07.049.
- [60] Xu, R., Yang, Z.-H., Zheng, Y., Wang, Q.-P., Bai, Y., Liu, J.-B., et al., 2019. Metagenomic analysis reveals the effects of long-term antibiotic pressure on sludge anaerobic digestion and antimicrobial resistance risk. Bioresour Technol 282, 179–188. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2019.02.120.
- [61] Yang, S.-F., Lin, C.-F., Yu-Chen Lin, A., Andy Hong, P.-K., 2011. Sorption and biodegradation of sulfonamide antibiotics by activated sludge: experimental assessment using batch data obtained under aerobic conditions. Water Res 45 (11), 3389–3397. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2011.03.052.
- [62] Zarei-Baygi, A., Harb, M., Wang, P., Stadler, L.B., Smith, A.L., 2019. Evaluating antibiotic resistance gene correlations with antibiotic exposure conditions in anaerobic membrane bioreactors. Environ Sci Technol 53 (7), 3599–3609. https:// doi.org/10.1021/acs.est.9b00798.
- [63] Zarei-Baygi, A., Harb, M., Wang, P., Stadler, L.B., Smith, A.L., 2020. Microbial community and antibiotic resistance profiles of biomass and effluent are distinctly affected by antibiotic addition to an anaerobic membrane bioreactor. Environ Sci: Water Res Technol 6 (3), 724–736 https://doi.org/10.1039/C9EW00913B.
- [64] Zhang, Y., Li, J., Liu, F., Yan, H., Li, J., Zhang, X., et al., 2019. Specific quorum sensing signal molecules inducing the social behaviors of microbial populations in anaerobic digestion. Bioresour Technol 273, 185–195. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. biortech.2018.11.022.
- [65] Zhao, L., Ji, Y., Sun, P., Deng, J., Wang, H., Yang, Y., 2019. Effects of individual and combined zinc oxide nanoparticle, norfloxacin, and sulfamethazine contamination on sludge anaerobic digestion. Bioresour Technol 273, 454–461. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2018.11.049.
- [66] Zheng, Z., Cai, Y., Zhang, Y., Zhao, Y., Gao, Y., Cui, Z., et al., 2021. The effects of C/N (10–25) on the relationship of substrates, metabolites, and microorganisms in "inhibited steady-state" of anaerobic digestion. Water Res 188, 116466. https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2020.116466.